

Illicit Markets for Humans



Brian Iselin

Ohrid, Macedonia

8-9 November 2004

Human Trafficking

- Some points to remember:
 - Palermo Convention and Trafficking Protocol
 - Diverse range of markets for people – not one market, not one crime.
 - Is all about the exploitation at the end.
 - Remember markets are demand driven – human trafficking exists where there are legal or moral proscriptions on uses of people but those uses are still wanted or needed.
 - Some features of those markets, a way of ‘breaking down’ the markets into bite-size pieces for analysis:
 - Structure
 - Typology
 - Vulnerabilities and Push Factors
 - Processes or transactions

Structural Indicators: Networks not monoliths

- Management/Supervising (oversight, conflict resolution, networking)
- Recruitment (Entry point for victims or clients)
- Escorts (transporters and guards)
- Corrupted Public Officials (Cover, Information, and Facilitation)
- Guiding/Navigating (Local knowledge)
- Supporting/Logistics (safe housing, travel docs + advice)
- Debt Collectors (collect owed money, break-in victims)
- Exploiters (arrange and oversee exploitative work)
- Re-escort (relocate and rotate victims, esp. in prostitution)

Typologies

- Debt bondage incl. sexual exploitation
- Child placement
- Marriage and mail-order
- Adoption
- Forced labour

Push factors and Vulnerabilities

- Push factors form an important set of crime indicators, especially for pre-emptive operations, as they help identify commodity sources.
- Vulnerabilities and push factors may include:
 - Lack of Citizenship;
 - Ethnicity;
 - Domestic Violence;
 - Poverty;
 - Proximity to crime clusters;
 - Being in prostitution.

Processes – (Example: Sexual Exploitation)

- All cases have unique process, but can generalise the following elements in 'commodity chain' for humans:
 - Context of vulnerability
 - Recruitment
 - Removal
 - Transportation
 - Establishment of Control
 - Arrival/Reception
 - Exploitation
 - Resolution

What does this mean for policy?

- The Policy Option “Holy Trinity”:
 - Supply Reduction – Demand Reduction – Harm Minimisation
- **First:** Set our priority including stating our objective – why is this a priority (or not)?
- **Assuming:** we seek to shrink the market’s dimensions (supply AND demand) while at the same time limiting harm to victims. How?
- **Then:** we seek to reduce safely the total number of transactions in the market, prioritising those where the victim suffers most harm.

Where in the market could we act?

- Traffickers are in business. If we want to disrupt business, then anything that interferes with the factors of production can reduce the number of transactions in the market.
- Factors of Production include:
 - **Communications (including marketing and advertising)**
 - **Venues – convenient and safe**
 - **A desire to consume the product (half the demand equation)**
 - **Disposable income (half the demand equation)**
 - **Sense of acting with impunity**
 - **Labour supply**
 - **Attractive ways of spending proceeds**
 - **Supply of commodities**

What transactions occur?

- Remember that in any trafficking case (drugs, people, whatever) we are talking about a ‘commodity chain’ that stretches across countries.
- Whether you have been labelled transit, destination, or source, transactions are occurring in your jurisdiction
- Some transactions we need to understand and act upon:
 - Between recruiter and victim
 - Between victim and exploiter
 - Between buyer and seller

How can we influence transactions?

- Deterring transactions is about effecting assessment of risk + cost
 - Increase Perceived Risk
 - **Increase perception of the chance of being caught**
 - **Increase perception of the chance of losing merchandise AND profits**
 - Increase Perceived Cost
 - **Increased severity of punishment**
 - **Increase spectre of fiscal punishment**
 - **Imposing time and cost associated with arrest/trial**
 - Increase inconvenience and erect 'barriers'

How do we influence transactions? (cont'd)

- Erode “Relational Capital”
 - Erode trust between players
 - Increase search time for buyers of illicit goods and services
 - Reduce clustering of activities
 - Act against advertising and marketing
 - Introduce uncertainty about venues (eg random raids, shaming, forcing relocation etc)
 - Interrupting transactions automatically forces higher costs on the seller.

Some Important Lessons

- **The Early Bird Gets the Worm:** Illicit markets build momentum, becoming entrenched over time. As we notice new markets emerging, we must act sooner rather than later, and act decisively to turn away would-be entrants.
- **A Slippery Slope:** more transactions demands more police. More thinly spread police means more transactions. If we allow any market to build uninterrupted, it will get out of control!!

Last Important Lesson

- **Match the Scorecard to the Game:** We should ensure, because we seek to change a market, that our performance is measured by whether and how we change (hopefully shrink!) that market:
 - We must set and observe performance indicators in the market, including: price, availability, new entrants, geographical shift in markets, change in methods of operation (remember: most crooks are change-averse!)

- Iselin Consulting -

